



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION COMMISSION ACTION

This is not a Certificate of Appropriateness and cannot be used to acquire permits

September 15, 2021

HDRC CASE NO: 2021-457

ADDRESS: 8911 CALLAGHAN RD
8931 CALLAGHAN RD

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: A portion of NCB 11642 BLK 2 LOT 9A
A portion of NCB 11642 BLK B LOT 8A

APPLICANT: Ellis Mumford-Russell/Post Oak Preservation Solutions - 10711 KIPP Way

OWNER: KIPP Texas Public Schools - 10711 KIPP Way

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting Findings of Historic Significance for two buildings located at 8911 and 8931 Callaghan Rd.

FINDINGS:

- a. The request for landmark designation was initiated by the property owner, who requests designation of approximately the south third of each parcel.
- b. **HISTORIC CONTEXT:** This property was most recently used as the convent for the Sisters of the Presentation of the Blessed Virgin Mary (Presentation Sisters), from the 1950s through the 2010s. The Sisters of the Presentation of the Blessed Virgin Mary was founded by Nano Nagle in 1775 in Cork, Ireland, for the purpose of educating indigent children. Beginning in 1833, the congregation spread to North America; between 1833 and 1890, the Presentation Sisters established ten additional communities across North America. In 1952, the San Antonio community was established at the subject property, the first US congregation. Presentation Sisters congregations are present in 23 countries, and the order has more than 1,600 sisters. Prior to the long-term ownership of the Presentation Sisters, the existing site was divided into two parcels as a part of a subdivision. Two separate residences which date to c 1927 were constructed roughly a third of the lots' depths off the southeast property line, fronting Callaghan Road. The house at 8911 Callaghan Rd was built by William C Bennett for Hugh and Adela Lockhart. Hugh Lockhart worked as the secretary/treasurer for the Household Furniture Company. William C Bennett developed Gramercy Pl with his brother Sam C Bennet under the name Sam C. Bennett Company. Founded in 1919, the Bennetts constructed homes in Gramercy Place (where they worked with architect and preservationist Harvey P Smith) and Woodlawn Place. William served as designer and superintendent for the company. The home was later owned by R.L. Kirkwood and Ruthe G. Kirkwood. R.L. Kirkwood owned and operated an oil and gas drilling company and separate production company, based out of San Antonio, Kirkwood and Morgan, Inc. which still holds active leases today, and Kirkwood Drilling Company, which R.L. Kirkwood formed in 1958 and later dissolved in 1965. While there was a later addition to the home, the original footprint of the Jud House at 8931 Callaghan appears unchanged. The 1960s addition to the home, added under the ownership of the Presentation Sisters, is distinct to the original. The house at 8931 Callaghan was likely named after Ed J Jud and Alice M Jud, who owned the property during the 1930s. Ed Jud owned a plumbing company with business partner Charles Ormond.
- c. **SITE CONTEXT:** 8911 and 8931 Callaghan St are located in the Vance Jackson neighborhood of City Council District 9. The area proposed for designation includes the southern third of both parcels and contains both of the historic south-facing homes. A map of the proposed boundary is included in this case file. The homes, which pre-date Callaghan Rd and are historically described as located on Vance Jackson Rd, are on a block bound to the south by Callaghan Rd, the east by Vance Jackson Rd, the north by Whitson Rd, and the west by Stonehaven Rd. The

parcels are covered in grass and old-growth trees, with asphalt driveways leading from Callaghan Rd to each house; the driveway at 8911 Callaghan Rd extends northwest to meet Stonehaven Rd. Each house has a concrete sidewalk leading to the front door.

d. **ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION:** 8911 Callaghan Rd is located along the south area of the site. It is a two-story stucco home with stylistic characteristics that closely resemble the Spanish Revival style. However, it additionally has some detailing which more closely resembles Mission Revival, visible along the parapet of the porte cochere and the second-story outdoor area. The house appears asymmetrical in plan because of its wings but has a symmetrical centralized rectangular mass with a low-pitched hipped roof with red Spanish tile. A single-story wing with a hipped roof, directly connected to the primary two-story mass is a prominent feature of the facade. It is symmetrical with more ornate detailing along the corners and grouped arched windows. The main entry is also an elevated and fenced area that leads to the arched doorway. Along the ground level, there are a series of arched windows, covered by operable window shutters. The upper story has a series of double-hung windows that are spaced equally and vary in size as well as paired throughout. 8931 Callaghan Rd, located along the east area of the site, is a two-story stucco home with stylistic characteristics that closely resemble Spanish Revival. The residence dates to approximately the 1920s to 1930s; however, an exact date of construction is unknown. It is an asymmetrical L-plan home with a prominent, front-facing gable that is flanked with wings of differing heights, a single-story side-gabled wing along the northeast and an unadorned two-story flat roof with a parapet to the south. The main entry is elevated with the principal arched door located beneath a bracketed canopy. A second entry with a 1950s era aluminum awning is located at the south wing which connects to the same elevated patio entry. With the exception of the two-story flat roof along the south wing, the roof is constructed with negligible roof overhang in red Spanish tile. The c. 1927 homes are the only structures staff considers contributing to the eligible landmark designation. Staff find additions to the south-facing houses, built after c. 1950, noncontributing.

e. **EVALUATION:** In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the 16 criteria listed. Staff evaluated the structures against all 16 criteria and determined that they were consistent with UDC sec. 35-607(b):

3. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the community, county, state, or nation; both properties were home to the first US congregation of the Sisters of the Presentation of the Blessed Virgin Mary, founded in 1775 in Cork, Ireland, and established in San Antonio in 1952 for the purpose of educating indigent children.

4. Its identification as the work of a master builder, designer, architect, or landscape architect whose individual work has influenced the development of the community, county, state, or nation; The house at 8911 Callaghan Rd was built by William C Bennett, designer and superintendent for Sam C Bennett Company, which designed and built in multiple San Antonio neighborhoods starting in 1919.

5. Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials; both properties are examples of Mission Revival residences with Spanish Revival influence.

8. Its historical, architectural, or cultural integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship; the structures have existed on site with largely reversible intrusions since c 1927.

f. The City offers a tax incentive for the substantial rehabilitation of historic properties because historic landmarks possess cultural and historical value and contribute to the overall quality and character of the City and its neighborhoods. If historic designation is approved, rehabilitation and restoration work may be eligible for this incentive. State and Federal tax incentives are also available for properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places and provide substantial relief for rehabilitation projects.

g. If the HDRC approves the Finding of Historic Significance, then the recommendation for designation is submitted to the zoning commission. The zoning commission will schedule a hearing and then forward its recommendation to the City Council. City Council has the ultimate authority to approve the historic designation zoning overlay.

h. Per UDC Sec. 35-453, once the commission makes a recommendation for designation, property owners must receive a written approval (a Certificate of Appropriateness) for any exterior work until the City Council makes their final decision.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of a Finding of Historic Significance and that the Historic and Design Review Commission should recommend approval for the landmark designation of 8911 and 8931 Callaghan Rd to the Zoning Commission and to the City Council based on findings a through e.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Approved as submitted.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Shanon Shea Miller". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Shanon" being more prominent.

Shanon Shea Miller
Historic Preservation Officer